

A Critical Analysis and Comparison of two Published Academic Journals in Education Field

Berivan M. A. Abdullah

Dept. of English Language, Faculty of Humanities, University of Zakho, Kurdistan Region – Iraq.

Received: 10. 2019 / Accepted: 11. 2019 / Published: 12. 2019 <https://doi.org/10.26436/hjuoz.2019.7.4.562>

ABSTRACT:

The purpose of this study is to critically analyse and evaluate two selected journal articles. The two articles are research papers in the education field; more specifically both journals are about the usage and implementation of Communicative Language Teaching. For ease of reading, each article is dealt with separately. This paper is to pinpoint their weaknesses and strengths. The two chosen papers are also critiqued from various perspectives such as methods of data collection and analysis, research layout and organization, validity and reliability of the data collected, sampling issue and ethical considerations. Although the titles are very similar, the content was different and the papers are written differently using various instruments for collecting data. This study concluded that both articles to some extent have weak points such as the use of instruments and the sampling size which were a very limited size especially in article Y. The ethical issues in both articles to some extent are considered, however, in one of the articles, it is less taken into account.

KEYWORDS: Critical, qualitative, quantitative, methodology, data collection.

1. Introduction

As we know nowadays, conducting and undertaking research has dramatically increased and improved. There is a number of various tools and approaches that affect the validity and reliability of a research in different fields. This research is mainly conducted for instructional purposes, to enrich university students and future researchers in Education fields, with significant knowledge about how to utilise appropriate methods and procedures in conducting effective research papers. This paper examines, criticizes and explains the mentioned issues around the two articles by evaluating them.

The materials used in this paper are as follow: The first article X: Raissi R. & Mohamad Nor BT. F. (2013). Evaluating the Computer Usage through Communicative Language Teaching (CLT) in Malaysian Secondary Schools. *International Journal of Information Technology & Computer Science (IJITCS)*, 7 (1), 122-129. The second article Y: Hiep, P. H. (2007). Communicative language teaching: Unity within diversity. *ELT Journal*, 61(3), 193-201. doi:10.1093/elt/ccm026

The main aim of this research is to critically analyse the above journal articles to pinpoint their weaknesses and strengths with regards to the methods of data collection and analysis, research layout and organization, validity and reliability of the data collected, sampling issue and ethical considerations.

This research is divided into nine sections; in each section literature of the theories and methods is given and the article is analysed and evaluated based on them. An introduction to the assignment is given in the introduction part in the first section. In section two, an overview of the both articles is provided. Section three analyses and discusses the methodology and data collection procedure of both articles. The fourth section is devoted to the qualitative and quantitative approaches utilised in both articles. The fifth part is about the validity and reliability of both articles. The sixth part evaluates the use of the samples in both journal articles. The findings are discussed and analysed in the seventh section. In the eighth section, the consideration of ethics is discussed and compared to the articles ethical issues. The following part highlights the alternative methods and data collections. In the last section, a list of the references is provided.

2.1 Article X:

This article is conducted by two researchers Raissi and Mohamad Nor (2013) in Malaysia. It was done to evaluate the usage of the computer through communicative language teaching (henceforth CLT). The research took place in a secondary school in Johor in Malaysia. Though the researchers did not mention the word purpose, it is clear from the title and the abstract of the article that the purpose is to investigate the use of computer technology in implementing CLT in Malaysia. The layout of this article is clear and organised as the researchers used heading and sub-headings to make clear each section of the article. The language used is very effective and simple to understand. It is worth mentioning that the writers explained every step of the article in a brief and clear way in the abstract section, such as the purpose, the research method that used to collect data and as well as the results of the findings.

The article mentioned the emerging time of the method which took place at 1970 and its main roles. As well as they argued about the aim of CLT that is focusing on meaning rather than form. As it is clearly mentioned, the goal of CLT is to give more attention to the communication of the students by using authentic materials in one side, and on the other side improving the communicative competence of the students.

The researcher decided to evaluate the use of the computer in CLT classes because of several reasons one of which is that CLT focuses on the students and teachers role. The teacher works as a facilitator to encourage students in communicating with the target language through using the computer and modern technologies. The utilizing of CLT is obligatory in secondary schools of Malaysia, therefore, the researcher decided to investigate the effectiveness of this technique from students perceptions. Also, the interaction of students should be increased in the class, because Malaysia is a tourist country and it is expected from students to be at a satisfactory level in communicating and using the Internet with foreign people.

Regarding research methods, only one research method which is semi structured interview was used to collect data from 30 ESL students aged between 13 to 16. The findings of these data showed a positive attitude to computerizing CLT and its

implementation in Malaysia.

In the conclusion section of this article the researcher concluded that Malaysia is a touristy place and it is a vital thing to work on improving the communicative competence of the students in learning English. Therefore, computerizing the CLT class, in a favorable way for teaching, might improve students' language.

2.2 Article Y:

This article is written by Hiep (2007) in Vietnam, which is about applying CLT in the class. The researcher began by mentioning Bax's (2003) negative opinion on implementing CLT. The researcher mentioned a brief introduction and the birth and theoretical tenets of CLT. In the first two paragraphs the researcher did not mention clearly what each section is about, which could be a weak point. However, the first paragraph seems more to be like an abstract, and the second one is the introduction, because in the second paragraph he explained the steps of the article. Clarifying the steps of articles is usually mentioned in the introduction part. To clarify it more the researcher could have mentioned the headings of each part of the article.

The purpose of this study is to discover the effectiveness and the implementation of CLT in Vietnam. The article gives an introduction about CLT and its principles. It mentions the importance of CLT approach in teaching foreign language all over the world. The researcher wanted to discover the effectiveness of this approach in class practice in Vietnam. Thus, he used qualitative approach for gathering data from three participants who are teachers at a university in Vietnam. In addition, for data collection, he used triangulation methodological strategy throughout the usage of both interview and observation methods.

The results of his study were positive. The three teachers indicated the importance of implementing CLT in teaching language. As it is indicated by the researcher, the use of authentic materials and activities in CLT and as well as having a significant amount of group or pair work showed a remarkable effectiveness in most of the counties. However, using this method in Vietnam made the teachers undergo a number of issues and difficulties in implementing it such as socio-cultural and political issues. To overcome these issues, it is recommended that teachers be trained to further improve their skills in implementing CLT successfully.

3. Methodology

This chapter analyses the method utilized for data collection and analysis of both articles and gives justifications to the chosen methods. Mason (2002) believes that the research methods are techniques that the researcher uses to collect data such as questionnaires, interviews, observations and also are the ones used to analyse the data collected. It is worth mentioning that the use of the combination of more than one research method of one of these approaches qualitative or quantitative (Denscombe, 1998) is called triangulation. However, the use of both quantitative research methods with qualitative research methods together is called mixed methods (Punch, 2009).

Data collection and analysis methods are important and should be used in each research in order to have a clear study and to know what methods were used and how data was gathered.

3.1 Research Methods in Article X:

Only one method is used in collecting data in this research which is the semi-structured interview a type of interview method. Lincoln and Guba (1985) divided interview into three types structured interview, semi-structured and unstructured interviews. Interview is defined as, 'an interchange of views between two or more people on a topic of mutual interest, sees

the centrality of human interaction for knowledge production, and emphasize the social situation of research data' (kvale 1996) cited in (Cohen, Manion and Morrison 2000:267). That is to say, interview generates the conversation between the interviewer and the interviewee. Therefore, the researcher might get deeper insight or 'greater depth' of the needed information (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2007:269). Moreover, semi structure interview has its advantages. The order of the questions in semi-structured interview cannot be an issue because it is less formal. As Robinson (2002) indicates, the researcher can manage the order of the questions according to the level of the participants' understanding.

However, interviews could have their own disadvantages, such as the answers of the interviewee could be non-standard (Dencombe, 2007). It also could be time consuming, if the participants take more time answering questions.

Neuman (2000) states that the interview is the most effective research method for educational research. This method has the ability to give the research more authenticity and deep insight into the topic (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2000). In this article, which is an educational research, the researcher used semi-structured interview successfully with 30 ESL secondary students in order to find out different point of views with regards to implementing the computerized CLT in class. The interview took place in the class. The researcher designed three phase of semi-structure interview; in each phase he asked one or two specific questions. This is because interview allows the participants to interpret their own opinion in discussing the specific situation (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2000).

The above argument makes it clear that the researcher in article (X) has effectively utilized the semi-structured interviews to reach the general aim and objectives of his study. However, it could be more reliable if the researcher used triangulation or another method with it, for instance questionnaire or observation method.

3.2 Research methods in Article Y:

In this article the researcher used case study in conducting his data. As Gray (2009) points out, a case study might have a greater effect than other research methods. This data collection tool is defined as 'a detailed study of an individual or a group or an event. The emphasis in case study is on explanation (Verma and Mallick, 1999: 115)'. However, the importance of the case study goes back to the data that are not only conducted through descriptive discussion, but also through the attribution of the casual relationship between the researcher and samples (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2000). This could lead to a more in-depth research (Thomas, 2009) that enables the researcher to gain greater and richer understanding of the topic and the data. However, the case study might have a 'lack of generalizability' (Verma and Mallick, 1999: 115). Therefore, the topic might not be always generalized to be typical to other similar subjects.

The case study is better to do with a small amount of samples to obtain greater results. However, with a larger number of samples rather than individual the case study might not be suitable (Denscombe, 2007). Thomas (2009) also points out the case study should not involve a wide range of samples because it is in-depth research, which he clearly states that the case study could be 'one case or a small set of cases' (p.115).

Just like article X, the researcher in article Y used interview, with three teachers about the implementation of CLT in classes and interviews were recorded. In addition to this, the teachers used the observation method. Gillham (2000) defines observation as observing the speaking and the gesture of the samples. Thomas (2009) adds to it that observing means to watch the participants carefully while doing a particular activity.

Observation is one method of qualitative research and here the researcher used this type of qualitative research. The aim of the qualitative research is to know the participants views beyond

the answers and questions of the research questions (Hollway and Jefferson, 2004). Thus because observation is one method of the qualitative data then their aims are the same, as Gray (2004: 238) states, "observation provides an opportunity to get beyond people's opinions and self-interpretations of their attitudes".

However, observation method might have some difficulties. One of which could be the uncomfortable situation of the students, as the participants might feel unconfident especially when they realize that they are being watched, observed and listened, which shows the effect of the observers (May, 2001). In interview and observation, time consuming could be another problem of the observation method. This could be because sometimes the answers of the participants take longer time than it is predicted. This article only used two methods for collecting data: these were the interview and observation.

4. Qualitative and Quantitative of the Both Articles

In this section the quantitative and qualitative approach of both articles are discussed and analysed.

Qualitative and quantitative approaches can be used in different fields for conducting studies, such as, education, science, social, and so forth. Each of these approaches could utilise different tools of research methods; the qualitative research might use questionnaire, interview, observation and document analysis (Gray, 2004). The use of these tools varies in process from one approach to the other, because each approach has some different points. As an illustration, the use of 'soft data' such as the use of impression, words, symbols rather than the hard data, the numbers (Neuman, 2000: 122). Moreover, joining these two approaches together makes the research to be more reliable and valid (Thomas, 2007). This combination is called triangulation. As Corbetta (2003) marked it as the use of more than one method in conducting research.

Quantitative research always deals with numbers and statistics for collecting data. Gray (2004: 286) defines it as the data that 'can be measured numerically' that makes it more precise. Neuman (2000:122) also adds that quantitative data 'are more concerned about measurement' which could be numbers and figures, that is why the graphs and tables are used to indicate it. Quantitative data has its advantage such as the questions and answers are fixed and predicted more than the qualitative data, which makes it easier to manage time. Moreover, the results and findings of the research are considered to be ranked accurately (Neuman, 2000). Thus, in quantitative research the data might be analyzed easier than the qualitative one. However, there are also some negative points about quantitative data; one of which is the use of the biased and subjective questions rather than objective and explaining one's own opinion as qualitative data are. Denscombe (1998: 205) supports this by saying "the analysis of quantitative data, in some respects, is no more neutral or objective than the analysis of qualitative data".

The qualitative research in contrast deals with more descriptive and objective data than figures and numbers (Neuman, 2000). Thus, the researcher might get unpredicted answers from the participants. Therefore, he might draw different conclusions and valuable data. In other words, the researcher who uses qualitative data can get some new findings based on the participants' answers and views. Denscombe (1998) supports this by saying the researcher might use and create new ideas based on samples ideas. Mackey and Gass (2005) add to that saying that the qualitative research has the potential of forming new ideas and hypotheses. This in turn might give meaning to the data. As Gray (2007: 319) indicates saying the qualitative research is "a rigorous and logical process through which data are given meaning".

Beside these strong points, there are negative ones as well. One of which, is getting a large amount of data because of the use

of open ended questions, that begin with why, how, and so on (Manson, 2002). Therefore, it might be time consuming and for the researcher not to be able to get the needed answer. Another point is that the participant might not be able to give any answers related to the aim of the study conducted (Hussey and Collis, 2009).

However, both of the chosen articles (article X and Y) employed the qualitative approach to conduct the research, which is clearly seen from the findings of the articles. That is to say the researchers did not use any numbering system such as the figures or charts and tables. Having said so it could be argued that the collected data in article X and Y might be more descriptive and subjective. Dawson (2002: p 14) states 'qualitative research explores attitudes, behaviour and experiences through such methods as interviews or focus groups. In an attempt to get an in-depth opinion from participants'. For example, in article X the participants were students in secondary school. They were asked about their own believes and views of the use of computer in communicative language classes. Similarly, the samples of article Y are three teachers. The questions and the collected data were about these three teachers experiences at school as well as about their thoughts of the best methods to be used with the students. Therefore, the results and findings of these two articles should've been stated in detail. Manson (2002: p 3) argues that 'the qualitative research aims to produce rounded and contextual understandings on the basis of rich, nuanced and detailed data'.

5. Validity and Reliability

In this section the validity and reliability characteristics are given and the two articles are analysed based on the given literature.

Validity and reliability are two important keys in judging on a piece of writing. Validity is trusty or honesty (Neuman, 2000). It is defined as the 'degree to which the instrument measures what is supposed to be measuring' (Thomas, 2009, p. 107). Therefore, it can be addressed with depth, honesty and richness (Cohen, Manion and Morisson, 2000). In other words, validity is about the value and the trust of the research findings that have been conducted by different research methods, as Gray (2009) argues, if the findings of a research are not the same as the previous conducted studies, then the research might not be valid.

There are two types of validity as Macky and Gass (2005) list them; the internal validity and external validity. Internal validity 'measures the extent to which the test is an indication of what it purports to be' (Macky and Gass, 2005 : p 128); that is to that the research methods of the research do their work in an accurate way. On the other hand, the external validity is mainly concerned with the 'degree to which the results can be generalized to the wider population, cases or situations' (Cohen, Manion and Morisson, 2000: p 109).

With regard to reliability, Bell (2005: 117) defines it as 'the extent to which a test of procedure produces similar results under constant conditions on all occasions'. Consistency is another word to define reliability (Macky and Gass, 2005). That is to say a research is considered reliable if the same findings are obtained from utilising more than one research methods, in different occasions and/or times. According to Cohen, Manion and Morisson, (2000) reliability in qualitative research includes real life fidelity, depth in answers and meaning, honesty, authenticity and comprehensiveness. Many factors can affect the reliability of a research such as the time, the participants and location. Therefore, these issues should be considered by the researcher while conducting a research.

5.1 Validity and reliability of article X:

The research topic in article X is specific which is about CLT in Malaysia. The researchers chose specific samples, such as the governmental schools and secondary level of students to conduct their research. They also mentioned the reasons for their choice of the samples in the article. This could be a strong point as the researchers did not choose the samples randomly (Cohen, Manion and Morisson, 2000).

Moreover, the researchers used only one method which is the semi-structured interview. They used the interview protocol and divided it into three phases, in each phase they asked a question to the students. The questions were about the implementation of CLT; its difficulty and the benefits of the use of technology with CLT. The same protocol was used with the whole class. With this regard, Gray (2004) argues the use of the same protocol with the participants minimises the bias of the interview, which in turn might make the research valid.

Furthermore, the researcher generalised the finding of the samples to the whole Malaysian secondary schools which shows the external validity. Because the researcher used the probability sampling that could produce accurate results, the researcher has analysed the data findings clearly (Neuman, 2000). For instance, each phase of the interview is discussed clearly in the results and discussion section. Therefore, this article could be considered as valid and reliable.

5.2 Validity and Reliability of Article Y:

In article Y the researcher used different methods such as the observation and interview with teachers in conducting the research. That is to say the multiple method is used, which in turn means it is the triangulation method (Gray, 2004). The findings reached via utilising the two methods that had rendered the same results, which means that this article is reliable and valid. Cohen, Manion and Morisson, (2000) state that the use of various methods or triangulation in research makes the research more valid and reliable.

Moreover, the researcher recorded the conversation and observation in the class for two to three weeks. Gray (2004) mentions recording the observation could be a good way of avoiding unreliability, and the data can be easily reviewed by the researcher. The time of observation is also good enough to be considered as a valid point. Gray (2009) in another study states that in the case of observation use, the research can be generalised and strengthened if the researcher was observing the students' behavior for a sufficient period. All the above points suggest that this article can be seen as valid and reliable.

6. Sampling

In this section the sampling element is discussed and argued. The two articles are also analysed critically with the drawn literature.

Sampling is a very vital element in conducting a research. It is defined by Mason (2002: p 120) as the 'principle and procedure used to identify, choose, and gain access to relevant data sources from which you will generate data using your chosen methods'. Moreover, sampling is necessary in generalising findings. Verma and Mallick (1999) state the more representative the sample is the more reliable and valid it becomes.

Regarding the sample number, a number of the researchers have argued that the proper sample number to be used is not set yet, as Cohen, Mansion and Morrison (2007: 101) state, 'there is no clear-cut answer for the correct sample size'. However, it is argued that a sample of thirty is mainly enough to be the case's minimum number if the research analysis is statistic (Borg and Gall 1979). The sample size might depend on the aim of the research, the type of the research methods, and the type of the population. However, there are a number of factors that might affect the sampling size. For instance, the time,

stress, money, institutions and organisations support, recourse and researchers number (Cohen, Mansion and Morrison, 2000). Moreover, to have a large sample means the study will have less sampling error (Denscombe, 2003).

Furthermore, sampling has two main types which are the probability and non-probability sampling. In the former the 'criteria for selecting respondents are known, while the latter 'the criteria are unknown' (Scott and Usher, 2011: p 78). Probability samples uses random sampling in order to give an equal probability to the chosen cases in the population. However, in non-probability samples the selection is not random and it does not use the theory of probability (Neuman, 2000).

6.1 Sampling in Article X:

The researchers had some criteria to choose their required samples. One of which was the school type, which was a state school because of the use of specific curriculum by the ministry of education. The second one is a population type which included 30 students in secondary schools whose ages were between thirteen and sixteen years old. As the researchers mentioned, the students level is more proficient than the lower levels in applying the CLT. The third one is the setting of the data collection which is located in Johor Bahru in Malaysia. This is because both researchers are able to gather their data in this place and to generalise it to the whole Malaysian secondary schools.

The researchers used stratified sampling in their study. Stratified sampling is a type of the probability sampling that 'involves dividing the population into homogenous groups, each group containing subjects with similar characteristics' (Cohen, Mansion and Morrison, 2000: p 101). It is sometimes called random sampling. The researchers used this sample to achieve their research aims. This sample type works as a representative of the whole population (Neuman, 2000). To ensure that the sample works, the researcher might take into consideration the use of random samples from different groups such as age, gender and background. However, though the researches have mentioned the use of the stratified sampling as well as the level of the students, specific school and location, they did not give much information about the students, for example their gender or the use of groups and their variable points. It is worth mentioning that the use of stratified sampling makes the research more accurate, which in turn makes it more valid and reliable (Neuman, 2000).

6.2 Sampling in Article Y:

In article Y the researcher only chose three teachers who participated in his research of the implementation of CLT in universities in Vietnam. This number of sample is considered to be a small number and might affect the research findings. Scott and Usher (2011: p 78) who state, 'errors are more likely to occur with smaller samples'. The sampling number also could not be enough to be representative and represent all Vietnam universities. The larger the number of the participants the better outcomes the research will produce. Moreover, the teachers had various ages, different qualification, teaching specialties, and length of experience.

The gender is another issue in this article as only one gender is used and the opposite gender is ignored. Using only one gender in the sampling might make a research unreliable and invalid. Cohen, Mansion and Morrison (2000) mention the balancing between the male and female in a research makes it stronger.

To conclude this section, various sample size is used in these two articles. However, the difference in sample size of these two articles might be due to the different aims of each of the researches.

7. Ethics

This section of the research deals with the ethical issues. It will discuss the use of ethics in both articles.

Ethical considerations are very important points to arise in conducting a research. Ethics is defined as 'what is or is not legitimate to do, or what moral research procedure involves' (Neuman, 2000: p 90). There are numbers of ethical issues that might arise when conducting a research and the researcher should take into consideration. Coehn, Manion and Morrison (2000) indicate that each part of the research might face an ethical problem and in order to avoid the ethical dilemmas the researcher should take these ethical issues into account, such as the autonomy, privacy, and confidentiality of the research.

7.1 Ethical Issues in Both Articles:

In article X 30 students were taken as participants for gathering data, their ages are between 13 -16. Thus, school and teachers consent might be needed. However, neither in this article, nor in article Y the ethical issue is mentioned which might be a big problem for the researcher and the whole research. Though it is argued that if the participants are not individual people and the participants are groups in a school, or public domain, the ethics will not be a very big deal (Thomas, 2009). In article Y, the participants are only three teachers with different ages and specialties. However, they are mature as they are teachers and they have self-responsibility of accepting to participate (Oliver, 2003).

Moreover, the use of research methods in article X involved a direct contact with the participants in the secondary school through the use of the semi-structured interview. While in article Y the researcher used recording interview and observation. It is very important that the researcher takes permission when interviewing and recording a participant's speech in order not to face any problem with ethical issues (Oliver, 2010). The records should also be placed in a safe place. Therefore, the researcher might clearly explain for the participants the aim of the research, the type of the data collect and the reason of conducting it (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2000).

Another crucial point in ethics is protecting the participants' privacy and confidentiality by keeping their identity anonymous. With thus regard Neuman (2000) defines anonymity as avoiding of the use of the subjects' names. For instance, in article X the participants are referred to as students, while in article Y they are referred to as teachers. Therefore, this indicates that the researchers were concerned about keeping the identity of the participants anonymous. Scott and Usher (2011) indicate that the names of the participants and the place that the research is conducted should be kept anonymous in order not to harm the community. A research might harm the participant in a number of ways for instance 'physical harm, psychological harm, legal harm, and harm to a person's career or income' (Neuman, 2000: p 92). Therefore, the implementation of the ethics means the avoidance of the participants' and nature's harm.

Furthermore, the voluntarism is another point to be mentioned. The participants are not obliged to participate in research and should be informed that they have the freedom to withdraw anytime they want to (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2000).

To conclude, though in both of the articles the researchers did not mention anything about the ethics or consents, but they show the avoidance of any kind of the harm that possibly occurs to the participants. The steps of data collection are also explained very clearly in both articles. Nevertheless, the anonymity of the participants is kept private in article X. However, in article Y the researcher mentioned the name of "teachers" which shows that the researcher did not fully take into consideration the ethical issues. This all shows that both of

the articles used a side of the ethical consideration in conducting their research and neglected some parts of it.

8. The Findings

In this section the results and outcomes of the both article are discussed and analysed.

8.1 The Findings in Article X:

The aim of this research was to find out the challenges and perception of CLT and the adaptation of the computer and technology method in Malaysian secondary schools. The researchers asked some questions that were related to the purpose of the research. They divided their questions into three phases and used the stratified sampling with semi-structured interview method. The first phase was favourable and unfavourable behaviour related to CLT use with technology. The researchers presented their results by using tables and percentages. The results showed that 63% of students choose favourable.

In the second part of the study the researcher asked some questions related to the course book used in the class. Most of the students showed that though the Malaysian textbook used authentic materials, it did not include any computerized CLT materials. With regards to the third phase, the researcher in this part asked some questions in order to know the effectiveness of the CLT in secondary schools from the students' points of view. Most of the students' showed that, in most of the CLT classes the teacher spend more time on receptive skills and neglect the productive skills. This shows that the CLT is not used properly with its all characteristics.

To sum up, the findings indicate that most of the students showed their favourability attitude toward the use of computerised CLT. However, they also mentioned that the teachers might take into consideration the students' needs. It is worth mentioning that the answers of these questions were discussed in detail and the findings and outcome of the research were very clear and organised.

8.2 The Findings in Article Y:

The aim of this research was applying the CLT and its effectiveness from teachers' points of view. The data were collected via interview recordings and observation. In this article, the researcher chose some selective and partial data of the participants. Moreover, some parts of the teachers' interview transcript were provided to show the results. In the interview section all three teachers highlighted the importance of implementing the CLT method in teaching English language in Vietnam. They argued that it is a meaningful method and will be beneficial for students' future life. In the observation, the researcher mentioned that in applying CLT in class teachers encountered many challenges. The factors could be from the large class size, cultural issues, or traditional exams as the teachers indicated. The results show that the teachers should make some effort in developing their teaching practices with regards to the usage of CLT.

Therefore, it could be argued that interpretivism is used in analysing both articles. Descombe (2003) defines interpretivism as the use of subjective data on the bases of the participants' points of views. Moreover, in both articles the data were analysed descriptively, which were easy to follow and comprehend.

9. Alternative

In this part, the alternative methods or approaches are dealt with to make the two articles more effective.

In both articles the researchers could have made their article stronger. Some suggestions are given below. One of which is the use of qualitative approach only in both. The researchers could use quantitative research alongside the qualitative approach to make the research findings stronger. In addition,

the use of research methods in both articles could have been further improved, for instance, in both articles the researchers could have used a questionnaire alongside with other methods of research to gather stronger data and come up with a more effective research. Another important point is the sampling. The researcher in article Y could have used more samples because having only 3 teachers from the same gender is argued to be unreliable. It would have been better if the researcher used some male teachers' views as well in his research.

Another point is the design of the research articles; in article X the researchers have designed their research in a very academic and simple way. For instance, the use of headings and subheadings as well as the simple language which makes it easier for the reader to follow each step. However, in article Y the headings are not used properly such as the first two paragraphs in the beginning of the research (See attached appendix (2)). If the researcher had mentioned that the first paragraph is the abstract and the second one is introduction that would have made it easier for the reader to know what part they are reading.

Conclusion

There are many similarities between the two chosen articles. Both articles were about a topic which is related to education and specifically teaching English language with the implementation of CLT approach. However, the contexts were different as in article X the researchers conducted their research in Malaysian secondary school and in article Y the research was conducted at a university in Vietnam. Both articles were collected using different methods, such as semi-structured interview, in gathering data in article X and case study and as well as observation and interview are used in article Y.

To conclude in both papers the qualitative approach is used by the researchers. Both articles to some extent have weak points such as the use of qualitative approach only and as well as the sampling size which was a very limited especially in article Y. The ethical issues in both articles, to some extent, is considered. However, in article Y the ethics is less taken into account.

References

- Bell, J. (2005). *Doing you Research Project: a Guide for First Time Researcher in Education and Social Science*. (3rd Ed). Buckingham: Open University Press.
- Borg, W. R. & Gall, M. D. (1979) *Educational Research: An Introduction* (3rd Ed). New York: Longman.
- Cohen, L., Manison, L. & Morrison, K. (2000). *Research Methods in Education*. (5th Ed). London: Routledge.
- Cohen, L. Manison, L. & Morrison, K. (2007). *Research Methods in Education*. (6th Ed). London: Routledge.
- Corbetta, P. (2003). *Social Research Theory Methods and Techniques*. London: SAGE Publications.
- Dawson, C. (2002). *Practical Research Methods: A User-friendly Guide to Mastering Research Techniques and Projects*. Oxford: How to Books.
- Dawson, C. (2009). *Introduction to Research Methods: A Practical Guide for Anyone Undertaking a Research Project*. (4th Ed). Oxford: How to Books Ltd.
- Denscombe, M. (1998). *The good research guide: For small-scale social research projects*. Buckingham: Open University Press.
- Denscombe, M. (2003). *The good research guide: For small-scale social research projects*. Maidenhead: Open University Press.
- Denscombe, M. (2007). *The Good Research Guide*. Maidenhead: OUP.
- Gillham, B. (2000). *Case Study Researcher Methods*. London: Continuum
- Gray, D. E. (2004). *Doing Research in the Real World*. London: SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Gray, D. E. (2009). *Doing Research in the Real World*. (2nd Ed). London: SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Hollway, W. & Jefferson, T. (2004). *Doing Qualitative Research Differently*. London: SAGE.
- Hussey, R. & Collis J. (2009). *Business Research: A Practical Guide for Undergraduate and Postgraduate Students*. (3rd Ed). Palgrave Macmillan.
- Lincoln, Y. S. & Guba, E. G. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Mackey, A. & Gass, M. S. (2005). *Second Language Research: Methodology and Design*. London: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc.
- Mason, J. (2002). *Qualitative Researching*. (2nd Ed). London: SAGE.
- May, T. (2001). *Social Research: Issues, Methods and Process*. (3rd Ed). London: Open University Press.
- Neuman, W. L. (2000). *Social Research Methods: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*. (4th ed). Boston: Allyn and Bacon.
- Oliver, P. (2003). *The Student's Guide to Research Ethics*. Maidenhead: Open University Press.
- Oliver, P. (2010). *The Students Guide to Research Ethics*. (2nd Ed). Berkshire: Mc Grow Hill.
- Punch, K. F. (2009). *Introduction to Research Methods in Education*. London: SAGE.
- Robinson, C. (2002). *Real World Research*. (2nd Ed). Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.
- Scott, D. & Usher, R. (2011). *Researching Education: Data Methods and Theory in Educational Enquiry*. (2nd Ed). London: Continuum.
- Thomas, G. (2007). *Education and Theory: Strangers in Paradigms*. Maidenhead: Open University Press Maidenhead.
- Thomas, G. (2009). *How to do Your Research Project*. London: SAGE Publication Ltd.
- Mallick, K., & Verma, G. (1999). *Researching Education: Perspectives and Techniques*. London: UK Falmer Press.

Appendix 1

Raissi R. & Mohamad Nor BT. F. (2013). Evaluating the Computer Usage through Communicative Language Teaching (CLT) in Malaysian Secondary Schools. *International Journal of Information Technology & Computer Science (IJITCS)*. 7(1), 122-129.

Appendix 2

Hiep, P. H. (2007). Communicative Language Teaching: Unity within Diversity. *ELT Journal*, 61(3), 193-201. doi:10.1093/elt/ccm026

يل نقدي ومقارنة بين اثنتين من المقالات الأكاديمية المنشورة في مجال التعليم

الملخص:

الغرض من هذه الدراسة هو تحليل نقدي وتقييم مقالتي مختارتي. المقالتان هما بحثان في مجال التعليم وبشكل أكثر تحديداً ، تدور كلتا المقالتان حول استخدام وتنفيذ طرق تدريس اللغة التواصلية. لسهولة القراءة ، تم التعامل مع كل مقالة على حدة. هذا البحث هي لتحديد نقاط الضعف والقوة. تم انتقاد المقالتي المختارتي من وجهات نظر مختلفة مثل طرق جمع البيانات وتحليلها، وتصميم وتنظيم البحث، وصحة وموثوقية البيانات التي تم جمعها، ومسألة أخذ العينات والاعتبارات الأخلاقية. على الرغم من أن العناوين متشابهة للغاية، إلا أن المحتوى كان مختلفاً والمقالتي مكتوبة بطريقة مختلفة باستخدام أدوات مختلفة لجمع البيانات. واستنتجت هذه الدراسة إلى أن كلا من المقالتي إلى حد ما لهما نقاط الضعف مثل استخدام أدوات جمع البيانات وحجم أخذ العينات التي كانت محدودة للغاية وخاصة في المقالة ص. وكذلك تم النظر في القضايا الأخلاقية في جمع البيانات في كلا المقالتي إلى حد ما ، ومع ذلك ، في إحدى المقالات ، لم يتم مراعاتها بشكل تام.

الكلمات الدالة: العينات، جمع البيانات، النوعية، الكمية، مناهج البحث.

شروقه كونه كما رهنه يي و هه فبه ركرنا دوو كوتارين نه كادي مي يين د بواري فيركرنيدا به لافكري

يوخته:

مه بهست ژ في فه كوليئي شروقه كونه كما رهنه يي ب هه لسه نگاندا هه دوو كوتارين دهستنيشانكري، كو نه هه دوو كوتاره گريدا بواري فيركرنينه ب گشتي و ب تايهت ژي دهستنيشانكرنا بكارئينان و كاره كيكرنا ريكنين وان هه كوتني ل دور زماني گه هاندني. ژيو ب ساناهيكرنا خواندنا في فه كوليئي، سه ره ده ريه كا جودا دگه ل هه دوو كوتاران هاتيه كرن، كو خالين ب هيژ و لاوازين وان كوتاران هاتيه دياركن. هه وه سا نه هه دوو كوتاره هاتيه هه لباردن ب ريكا نيرينين جياواز، وه كي (ريكنين كۆمكرنا داتايان و شروقه كونه وان ، چيكرن و ريكخستنا فه كوليئي، درستي و ته ماميا داتايين هاتيه كۆمكرن، نه و سه ريه ده يين هاتيه وه رگرتن ب ده ربرين و ديئنين ره وشتي) ، زيده باري وي چه ندي كو هه دوو ناف و نيشانين وان كوتاران وه كه هه فن زلايي هنده ك مه بهستان، به لي پيكه يينين و كۆمكرنا داتايين وان جياوازين و هه دوو كوتار ب شيوه يه كي جياواز هاتيه نفيسين. □

د نه نجامين في فه كوليئي دا بۆمه ديارديت كو هه ر نيك ژوان كوتاران سنوره كي دهستنيشاكري يي هه ي ژلايي خالين لاوازه، وه كي (بكارئينانا نامرازين كۆمكرنا داتايان، قه باري وه رگرتنا نموونان نه وين كو ب كي مي هاتيه بكارئينان ب تايه تي ژي د كوتارا (Y□ دا، هه وه سا ديئنا بابه تين ره وشتي د كۆمكرنا داتايان دا، سه ره پاي هندي كو نه هه بابه ته ب ريكه كا درستي د نيك ژفان كوتاران دا نه هاتيه پيش چاف وه رگرتن. □

په يقين سه ره كي: رهنه، جورى، جه ندي، ريكنين فه كوليئي، كۆمكرنا داتايان.